

Proceedings of the Arizona Game and Fish  
Commission License Revocation and Civil  
Assessment Hearings  
Time Certain – 2:00 p.m.  
Friday, April 17, 2009  
Arizona Game and Fish Department  
5000 West Carefree Highway  
Phoenix, Arizona 85086

PRESENT: (Commission)

(Director's Staff)

Chairman Robert D. Hernbrode  
Vice Chair Jennifer L. Martin  
Commissioner Robert R. Woodhouse  
Commissioner Norman W. Freeman  
Commissioner Jack F. Husted

Director Larry D. Voyles  
Deputy Director Gary R. Hovatter  
Deputy Director Bob Broscheid  
Assistant Attorney General Jim Odenkirk  
Assistant Attorney General Shelley Cutts

Hearings on License Revocations for Violation of Game and Fish Codes and Civil Assessments  
for the Illegal Taking and/or Possession of Wildlife

**Presenter:** Gene Elms, Law Enforcement Branch Chief

Mr. Elms presented the cases below to the Commission. Each of these cases were reviewed and it was determined that all cases met the criteria established in A.R.S. §15-714, §17-238, §17-314, §17-340, §17-362 and/or §17-363 for Commission action. The Commission and the respondents were provided with copies of the original court docket and case reports prepared by the officers along with copies of all other pertinent materials in each of these cases. All of these exhibits may be considered by the Commission in order to make a final determination. Each of the following individuals were legally noticed for this hearing.

<u>Name</u>	<u>Conviction</u>
Richard Evans	Count B: take deer in excess of bag limit.
Richard Evans	Count A: take deer without a valid tag.
Cory Beringer	Count A: take deer (decoy) without valid permit. Count B: shoot from a roadway.
Michael Dorough	Count A: possession of unlawfully taken big game.
Arthur Carpenter	Count D: possess unlawfully taken wildlife (ridgenose rattlesnake), Citation 241093 Count E: possess unlawfully taken wildlife (2 twin spotted rattlesnakes), Citation 241093 Count A: take wildlife without a hunting license (patch nosed snake), Citation 241095

Christopher Meiner	Count A: litter while hunting Count B: take wildlife during the closed season (mule deer fawn) Count C: possess unlawfully taken wildlife (mule deer fawn)
William Wynd	Count A: take elk from a motor vehicle. Count B: possess elk which was unlawfully taken.
William Wynd II	Count A: possess elk which was unlawfully taken.
David Mathews	Count A: possession of unlawfully taken mountain lion.

Roll call was taken and the following were present: Cory Beringer, William Wynd, William Wynd II, David Mathews.

Richard Evans requested and was granted a continuous by the Department.

Mr. Elms stated that the civil assessment process is not intended to be punitive, but is a process allowing the Commission to recover financial damages to compensate the State for the loss of any wildlife. Hunter Education requirements are imposed as a remedial measure to increase knowledge and prevent future violations and not as punishment.

The Commission was asked to consider and take action on the license revocations and/or civil assessments for the individuals listed above.

**Motion:** Woodhouse moved and Martin seconded THAT THE COMMISSION VOTE TO TAKE JURISDICTION IN THESE CASES.

**Vote:** Unanimous

\* \* \* \* \*

Michael A. Dorough

Dorough was found guilty by the Flagstaff Justice Court for: Count A: Possession of unlawfully taken big game (elk); and sentenced Count A: Fined \$158.00.

Case Officer Adams was available by phone and answered questions for the Commission.

Dorough was not present.

Mr. Elms noted that Dorough was cited only for possession and not for take because the evidence was circumstantial. However, the preponderance of the evidence indicates that he did take the animal and so he was noticed for revocation and civil assessment.

Ms. Cutts confirmed that the Commission could both revoke and civilly assess for unlawful possession.

**Motion:** Martin moved and Husted seconded THAT THE LICENSE(S) AND/OR LICENSES PRIVILEGES OF MICHAEL A. DOROUGH TO HUNT, FISH, AND TRAP IN THE STATE OF ARIZONA BE REVOKED AND HE BE DENIED ANOTHER FOR A PERIOD OF FIVE (5) YEARS; THAT THE CURRENT LICENSE(S) BE SUSPENDED AS OF THE DATE OF THIS HEARING, AND THAT IT/THEY BE REVOKED AS OF THE DATE THE ORDER IN THIS CASE IS SIGNED BY THE DIRECTOR; THAT HE BE REQUIRED TO COMPLETE THE HUNTER EDUCATION COURSE, AND PROVIDE PROOF TO THE DEPARTMENT'S LAW ENFORCEMENT BRANCH, BEFORE APPLYING FOR ANY OTHER LICENSE TO HUNT IN THIS STATE; THAT THE DEPARTMENT BE DIRECTED TO COLLECT CIVIL DAMAGES OR TO BRING CIVIL ACTION AGAINST MICHAEL A. DOROUGH TO COLLECT THE AMOUNT OF \$8,000.00 FOR THE LOSS OF ONE (1) 6X6 TROPHY BULL ELK; AND FURTHER MOVE THAT THE DIRECTOR, AS SECRETARY TO THE COMMISSION, BE DIRECTED TO SIGN AND ISSUE A FINDING OF FACT, CONCLUSIONS OF LAW AND AN ORDER IN THIS MATTER PURSUANT TO THIS MOTION.

Commissioners Woodhouse and Freeman commented that they were uncomfortable with the assessment in this case because Dorough was not convicted on the take of the elk.

**Vote:** Aye - Martin, Husted  
Nay – Hernbrode, Woodhouse, Freeman  
Failed 3 to 2

**Motion:** Woodhouse moved and Freeman seconded THAT THE LICENSE(S) AND/OR LICENSES PRIVILEGES OF MICHAEL A. DOROUGH TO HUNT, FISH, AND TRAP IN THE STATE OF ARIZONA BE REVOKED AND HE BE DENIED ANOTHER FOR A PERIOD OF FOUR (4) YEARS; THAT THE CURRENT LICENSE(S) BE SUSPENDED AS OF THE DATE OF THIS HEARING, AND THAT IT/THEY BE REVOKED AS OF THE DATE THE ORDER IN THIS CASE IS SIGNED BY THE DIRECTOR; THAT HE BE REQUIRED TO COMPLETE THE HUNTER EDUCATION COURSE, AND PROVIDE PROOF TO THE DEPARTMENT'S LAW ENFORCEMENT BRANCH, BEFORE APPLYING FOR ANY OTHER LICENSE TO HUNT IN THIS STATE; AND FURTHER MOVE THAT THE DIRECTOR, AS SECRETARY TO THE COMMISSION, BE DIRECTED TO SIGN AND ISSUE A FINDING OF FACT, CONCLUSIONS OF LAW AND AN ORDER IN THIS MATTER PURSUANT TO THIS MOTION.

Commissioner Martin commented that if Dorough didn't take this animal, it seems that he would be at this hearing or have communicated with the Department or Commission in some fashion after receiving notification that his license may be revoked for five years and he may be assessed for \$8,000.

After further discussion Commissioner Freeman withdrew his second and Commissioner Woodhouse withdrew his motion.

**Motion withdrawn.**

**Motion:** Husted moved and Martin seconded THAT THE LICENSE(S) AND/OR LICENSES PRIVILEGES OF MICHAEL A. DOROUGH TO HUNT, FISH, AND TRAP IN THE STATE OF ARIZONA BE REVOKED AND HE BE DENIED ANOTHER FOR A PERIOD OF **FOUR (4) YEARS**; THAT THE CURRENT LICENSE(S) BE SUSPENDED AS OF THE DATE OF THIS HEARING, AND THAT IT/THEY BE REVOKED AS OF THE DATE THE ORDER IN THIS CASE IS SIGNED BY THE DIRECTOR; THAT HE BE REQUIRED TO COMPLETE THE HUNTER EDUCATION COURSE, AND PROVIDE PROOF TO THE DEPARTMENT'S LAW ENFORCEMENT BRANCH, BEFORE APPLYING FOR ANY OTHER LICENSE TO HUNT IN THIS STATE; THAT THE DEPARTMENT BE DIRECTED TO COLLECT CIVIL DAMAGES OR TO BRING CIVIL ACTION AGAINST MICHAEL A. DOROUGH TO COLLECT THE AMOUNT OF **\$8,000.00** FOR THE LOSS OF **ONE (1) 6X6 TROPHY BULL ELK**; AND FURTHER MOVE THAT THE DIRECTOR, AS SECRETARY TO THE COMMISSION, BE DIRECTED TO SIGN AND ISSUE A FINDING OF FACT, CONCLUSIONS OF LAW AND AN ORDER IN THIS MATTER PURSUANT TO THIS MOTION.

**Vote:** Unanimous

Chairman Hernbrode stated that the way he read the report it left doubt that Dorough shot the elk, but after talking to the Case Officer, it appeared that he probably did. Chairman Hernbrode requested that the Commission be given more information on the facts and that all the information be clearly stated in the report so that the Commission can make the best informed decisions.

\* \* \* \* \*

Cory A. Beringer

Beringer was found guilty by the Snowflake Justice Court for: Count A: Take deer (decoy) without valid permit; and Count B: Shoot from a roadway; and sentenced Count A and B: Fined \$520.00.

Case Officer Lautzenheiser was present.

At Beringer's request, Mr. Elms provided the Commission with copies of Beringer's Court documents that showed his plea as no-contest and not as a guilty plea and a copy of a statement that Beringer wanted to read to the Commission.

Beringer addressed the Commission and read the following statement: "As provided to the hearing members, I did in fact plead no-contest to these charges rather than guilty as was stated in all of my documentation. I realize this is a technicality, but I do request that the correct plea be reflected in the official record. My understanding is that a no-contest plea allows me the opportunity to respond to the charges and I would appreciate the time of the hearing members to do so now. I take full responsibility for my actions, as I have all my life. I did something which was entirely wrong and I fully recognize that. My reasons are no excuse and I'll have to live with this forever. I'm asking for leniency in your decision. I ask this because I am an avid hunter and any revocation of my privileges would be extremely painful to me. I live for hunting and fishing and the camaraderie that comes with it. I respectfully ask the hearing members, do

not take my privileges away. Again, I am very regretful of my actions. I'm more than willing to answer any questions you may have. Thank you."

James Beringer (Cory Beringer's father) addressed the Commission and asked for leniency in the Commission's decision.

**Motion:** Woodhouse moved and Hernbrode seconded THAT THE LICENSE(S) AND/OR LICENSES PRIVILEGES OF CORY A. BERINGER TO HUNT, FISH, AND TRAP IN THE STATE OF ARIZONA BE REVOKED AND HE BE DENIED ANOTHER FOR A PERIOD OF FIVE (5) YEARS; THAT THE CURRENT LICENSE(S) BE SUSPENDED AS OF THE DATE OF THIS HEARING, AND THAT IT/THEY BE REVOKED AS OF THE DATE THE ORDER IN THIS CASE IS SIGNED BY THE DIRECTOR; THAT HE BE REQUIRED TO COMPLETE THE HUNTER EDUCATION COURSE, AND PROVIDE PROOF TO THE DEPARTMENT'S LAW ENFORCEMENT BRANCH, BEFORE APPLYING FOR ANY OTHER LICENSE TO HUNT IN THIS STATE; AND FURTHER MOVE THAT THE DIRECTOR, AS SECRETARY TO THE COMMISSION, BE DIRECTED TO SIGN AND ISSUE A FINDING OF FACT, CONCLUSIONS OF LAW AND AN ORDER IN THIS MATTER PURSUANT TO THIS MOTION.

**Vote:** Aye - Hernbrode, Woodhouse, Freeman, Husted  
Nay - Martin  
Passed 4 to 1

\* \* \* \* \*

William D. Wynd

Wynd was found guilty by the Snowflake Justice Court for: Count A: Take elk from a motor vehicle; and Count B: Possess elk which was unlawfully taken; and sentenced Count A and B: Fined \$570.00.

Wynd was present and addressed the Commission stating that everything in the report was true. They started lying and if they hadn't it would have been a lot better. It turned out to be a lot of hard work and fines.

Case Officer Lautzenheiser was present and answered questions for the Commission.

**Motion:** Martin moved and Freeman seconded THAT THE LICENSE(S) AND/OR LICENSES PRIVILEGES OF WILLIAM D. WYND TO HUNT, FISH, AND TRAP IN THE STATE OF ARIZONA BE REVOKED AND HE BE DENIED ANOTHER FOR A PERIOD OF TWO (2) YEARS; THAT THE CURRENT LICENSE(S) BE SUSPENDED AS OF THE DATE OF THIS HEARING, AND THAT IT/THEY BE REVOKED AS OF THE DATE THE ORDER IN THIS CASE IS SIGNED BY THE DIRECTOR; THAT HE BE REQUIRED TO COMPLETE THE HUNTER EDUCATION COURSE, AND PROVIDE PROOF TO THE DEPARTMENT'S LAW ENFORCEMENT BRANCH, BEFORE APPLYING FOR ANY OTHER LICENSE TO HUNT IN THIS STATE; AND FURTHER MOVE THAT THE DIRECTOR, AS SECRETARY TO THE COMMISSION, BE DIRECTED TO SIGN AND ISSUE A FINDING OF FACT,

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW AND AN ORDER IN THIS MATTER PURSUANT TO THIS MOTION.

Commissioner Woodhouse commented that he will vote no because of the lies that were told and because the third individual in this case has still not been named by Mr. Wynd.

**Vote:** Aye - Martin, Freeman  
Nay - Hernbrode, Woodhouse, Husted  
Failed 3 to 2

**Motion:** Woodhouse moved and Husted seconded THAT THE LICENSE(S) AND/OR LICENSES PRIVILEGES OF WILLIAM D. WYND TO HUNT, FISH, AND TRAP IN THE STATE OF ARIZONA BE REVOKED AND HE BE DENIED ANOTHER FOR A PERIOD OF FIVE (5) YEARS; THAT THE CURRENT LICENSE(S) BE SUSPENDED AS OF THE DATE OF THIS HEARING, AND THAT IT/THEY BE REVOKED AS OF THE DATE THE ORDER IN THIS CASE IS SIGNED BY THE DIRECTOR; THAT HE BE REQUIRED TO COMPLETE THE HUNTER EDUCATION COURSE, AND PROVIDE PROOF TO THE DEPARTMENT'S LAW ENFORCEMENT BRANCH, BEFORE APPLYING FOR ANY OTHER LICENSE TO HUNT IN THIS STATE; THAT THE DEPARTMENT BE DIRECTED TO COLLECT CIVIL DAMAGES OR TO BRING SHARED CIVIL ACTION AGAINST WILLIAM D. WYND TO COLLECT THE AMOUNT OF \$2,500.00 FOR THE LOSS OF ONE (1) CALF ELK; AND FURTHER MOVE THAT THE DIRECTOR, AS SECRETARY TO THE COMMISSION, BE DIRECTED TO SIGN AND ISSUE A FINDING OF FACT, CONCLUSIONS OF LAW AND AN ORDER IN THIS MATTER PURSUANT TO THIS MOTION.

Commissioners Martin and Freeman commented that they were not comfortable with a civil assessment since both William Wynd and William Wynd II were in possession of a valid tag.

**Vote:** Aye - Woodhouse, Husted  
Nay - Hernbrode, Martin, Freeman  
Failed 3 to 2

**Motion:** Hernbrode moved and Freeman seconded THAT THE LICENSE(S) AND/OR LICENSES PRIVILEGES OF WILLIAM D. WYND TO HUNT, FISH, AND TRAP IN THE STATE OF ARIZONA BE REVOKED AND HE BE DENIED ANOTHER FOR A PERIOD OF FIVE (5) YEARS; THAT THE CURRENT LICENSE(S) BE SUSPENDED AS OF THE DATE OF THIS HEARING, AND THAT IT/THEY BE REVOKED AS OF THE DATE THE ORDER IN THIS CASE IS SIGNED BY THE DIRECTOR; THAT HE BE REQUIRED TO COMPLETE THE HUNTER EDUCATION COURSE, AND PROVIDE PROOF TO THE DEPARTMENT'S LAW ENFORCEMENT BRANCH, BEFORE APPLYING FOR ANY OTHER LICENSE TO HUNT IN THIS STATE; AND FURTHER MOVE THAT THE DIRECTOR, AS SECRETARY TO THE COMMISSION, BE DIRECTED TO SIGN AND ISSUE A FINDING OF FACT, CONCLUSIONS OF LAW AND AN ORDER IN THIS MATTER PURSUANT TO THIS MOTION.

**Vote:** Aye - Hernbrode, Martin, Freeman  
Nay - Woodhouse, Husted

Passed 3 to 2

\* \* \* \* \*

William D. Wynd II

Wynd II was found guilty by the Snowflake Justice Court for: Count A: Possess elk which was unlawfully taken; and sentenced Count A: Fined \$260.00.

Wynd II was present and addressed the Commission apologizing for his actions.

Case Officer Lautzenheiser was present.

**Motion:** Hernbrode moved and Husted seconded THAT THE LICENSE(S) AND/OR LICENSES PRIVILEGES OF WILLIAM D. WYND II TO HUNT, FISH, AND TRAP IN THE STATE OF ARIZONA BE REVOKED AND HE BE DENIED ANOTHER FOR A PERIOD OF FIVE (5) YEARS; THAT THE CURRENT LICENSE(S) BE SUSPENDED AS OF THE DATE OF THIS HEARING, AND THAT IT/THEY BE REVOKED AS OF THE DATE THE ORDER IN THIS CASE IS SIGNED BY THE DIRECTOR; THAT HE BE REQUIRED TO COMPLETE THE HUNTER EDUCATION COURSE, AND PROVIDE PROOF TO THE DEPARTMENT'S LAW ENFORCEMENT BRANCH, BEFORE APPLYING FOR ANY OTHER LICENSE TO HUNT IN THIS STATE; AND FURTHER MOVE THAT THE DIRECTOR, AS SECRETARY TO THE COMMISSION, BE DIRECTED TO SIGN AND ISSUE A FINDING OF FACT, CONCLUSIONS OF LAW AND AN ORDER IN THIS MATTER PURSUANT TO THIS MOTION.

**Vote:** Aye - Hernbrode, Husted  
Nay - Martin, Woodhouse, Freeman  
Failed 3 to 2

**Motion:** Martin moved and Hernbrode seconded THAT THE LICENSE(S) AND/OR LICENSES PRIVILEGES OF WILLIAM D. WYND II TO HUNT, FISH, AND TRAP IN THE STATE OF ARIZONA BE REVOKED AND HE BE DENIED ANOTHER FOR A PERIOD OF THREE (3) YEARS; THAT THE CURRENT LICENSE(S) BE SUSPENDED AS OF THE DATE OF THIS HEARING, AND THAT IT/THEY BE REVOKED AS OF THE DATE THE ORDER IN THIS CASE IS SIGNED BY THE DIRECTOR; THAT HE BE REQUIRED TO COMPLETE THE HUNTER EDUCATION COURSE, AND PROVIDE PROOF TO THE DEPARTMENT'S LAW ENFORCEMENT BRANCH, BEFORE APPLYING FOR ANY OTHER LICENSE TO HUNT IN THIS STATE; AND FURTHER MOVE THAT THE DIRECTOR, AS SECRETARY TO THE COMMISSION, BE DIRECTED TO SIGN AND ISSUE A FINDING OF FACT, CONCLUSIONS OF LAW AND AN ORDER IN THIS MATTER PURSUANT TO THIS MOTION.

**Vote:** Aye - Hernbrode, Martin, Woodhouse, Freeman  
Nay - Husted  
Passed 4 to 1

\* \* \* \* \*

David A. Mathews

Mathews was found guilty by the Flagstaff Justice Court for: Count A: possession of unlawfully taken mountain lion; and sentenced Count A: Fined \$550.00 and 6 months unsupervised probation.

Mathews was present and addressed the Commission stating that he was sorry for the choice he made that day and has learned a valuable lesson. He has disassociated himself from the people he got in trouble with. He is a fulltime guide and that is how he earns his living.

Jenna Mathews, addressed the Commission on her husbands behalf speaking on his good character and lessons learned.

Marvin James, (Mr. Mathews' employer) addressed the Commission on Mr. Mathews behalf and asked for leniency.

The Commission asked questions discussed the details of the case and with Mr. Mathews.

Case Officer Peebles was present via telephone and answered questions for the Commission stating that Mathews was cooperative, respectful and forthright.

**Motion:** Woodhouse moved and Martin seconded THAT THE LICENSE(S) AND/OR LICENSES PRIVILEGES OF DAVID A. MATHEWS TO HUNT, FISH, AND TRAP IN THE STATE OF ARIZONA BE REVOKED AND HE BE DENIED ANOTHER FOR A PERIOD OF TWO (2) YEARS; THAT THE CURRENT LICENSE(S) BE SUSPENDED AS OF THE DATE OF THIS HEARING, AND THAT IT/THEY BE REVOKED AS OF THE DATE THE ORDER IN THIS CASE IS SIGNED BY THE DIRECTOR; THAT HE BE REQUIRED TO COMPLETE THE HUNTER EDUCATION COURSE, AND PROVIDE PROOF TO THE DEPARTMENT'S LAW ENFORCEMENT BRANCH, BEFORE APPLYING FOR ANY OTHER LICENSE TO HUNT IN THIS STATE; AND FURTHER MOVE THAT THE DIRECTOR, AS SECRETARY TO THE COMMISSION, BE DIRECTED TO SIGN AND ISSUE A FINDING OF FACT, CONCLUSIONS OF LAW AND AN ORDER IN THIS MATTER PURSUANT TO THIS MOTION.

**Vote:** Aye - Martin, Woodhouse, Husted  
Nay - Hernbrode, Freeman  
Passed 3 to 2

\* \* \* \* \*

Arthur L. Carpenter

Carpenter was found guilty by the Cochise County Justice Court for: Count D: Possess unlawfully taken wildlife (ridgenose rattlesnake), Citation 241093; Count E: Possess unlawfully taken wildlife (2 twin spotted rattlesnakes), Citation 241093; Count A: Take wildlife without a hunting license (patch nosed snake), Citation 241095; and sentenced total Fined \$1,356.00 with \$452.00 suspended and to remain law abiding for the next 6 months.



Carpenter was not present but sent a letter to the Department which Mr. Elms read to the Commission. The letter stated that Carpenter did not know he was breaking the law and that he loved and cared for the animals for many years.

Case Officer Jontz was present and answered questions for the Commission.

**Motion:** Woodhouse moved and Husted seconded THAT THE LICENSE(S) AND/OR LICENSES PRIVILEGES OF ARTHUR L. CARPENTER TO HUNT, FISH, AND TRAP IN THE STATE OF ARIZONA BE REVOKED AND HE BE DENIED ANOTHER FOR A PERIOD OF FIVE (5) YEARS; THAT THE CURRENT LICENSE(S) BE SUSPENDED AS OF THE DATE OF THIS HEARING, AND THAT IT/THEY BE REVOKED AS OF THE DATE THE ORDER IN THIS CASE IS SIGNED BY THE DIRECTOR; THAT HE BE REQUIRED TO COMPLETE THE HUNTER EDUCATION COURSE, AND PROVIDE PROOF TO THE DEPARTMENT'S LAW ENFORCEMENT BRANCH, BEFORE APPLYING FOR ANY OTHER LICENSE TO HUNT IN THIS STATE; THAT THE DEPARTMENT BE DIRECTED TO COLLECT CIVIL DAMAGES OR TO BRING SHARED CIVIL ACTION AGAINST ARTHUR L. CARPENTER TO COLLECT THE AMOUNT OF \$2,000.00 FOR THE LOSS OF TWO (2) BANDED ROCK RATTLESNAKES, ONE (1) DIAMONDBACK RATTLESNAKE, ONE (1) DESERT TORTOISE, ONE (1) MOUNTAIN KING SNAKE, TWO (2) GOPHER SNAKES AND ONE (1) LONG NOSED SNAKE; AND FURTHER MOVE THAT THE DIRECTOR, AS SECRETARY TO THE COMMISSION, BE DIRECTED TO SIGN AND ISSUE A FINDING OF FACT, CONCLUSIONS OF LAW AND AN ORDER IN THIS MATTER PURSUANT TO THIS MOTION.

\* \* \* \* \*

Meeting recessed for a break at 3:37 p.m.

Meeting reconvened at 3:51 p.m.

\* \* \* \* \*

Arthur L. Carpenter (continued)

Commissioner Husted asked if the Commission's actions today would preclude Mr. Carpenter from obtaining any kind of collection or possession permit that could be issued by the Department.

Mr. Odenkirk stated that the Commission's action today will be focused on license to take. There are many permits that the Department issues to possess live wildlife that do not require a hunting license. This individual could apply those permits to possess live wildlife and the Department could issue a permit if he qualified for that particular permit. However, there are species that Mr. Carpenter has been in possession of that the Department would not authorize a permit to possess or there is no season that allows for the take of those species.

Case Officer Jontz clarified that the reptile facilities were not in good condition and that some of the animals had health issues.

The Commission confirmed with Officer Jontz that the assessment was for animals that died in Carpenter's care.

**Vote:** Unanimous

\* \* \* \* \*

Christopher L. Meiner

Meiner was found guilty by the Cochise County Justice Court for: Count A: Litter while hunting  
Count B: Take wildlife during the closed season (mule deer fawn); Count C: Possess unlawfully  
taken wildlife (mule deer fawn); and sentenced Count A, B and C: Fined \$1,356.00 with  
\$452.00 suspended.

Meiner was not present.

Case Officer Jontz was present and answered questions for the Commission.

**Motion:** Freeman moved and Martin seconded THAT THE LICENSE(S) AND/OR LICENSES  
PRIVILEGES OF CHRISTOPHER L. MEINER TO HUNT, FISH, AND TRAP IN THE  
STATE OF ARIZONA BE REVOKED AND HE BE DENIED ANOTHER FOR A PERIOD  
OF FIVE (5) YEARS; THAT THE CURRENT LICENSE(S) BE SUSPENDED AS OF THE  
DATE OF THIS HEARING, AND THAT IT/THEY BE REVOKED AS OF THE DATE THE  
ORDER IN THIS CASE IS SIGNED BY THE DIRECTOR; THAT HE BE REQUIRED TO  
COMPLETE THE HUNTER EDUCATION COURSE, AND PROVIDE PROOF TO THE  
DEPARTMENT'S LAW ENFORCEMENT BRANCH, BEFORE APPLYING FOR ANY  
OTHER LICENSE TO HUNT IN THIS STATE; THAT THE DEPARTMENT BE DIRECTED  
TO COLLECT CIVIL DAMAGES OR TO BRING SHARED CIVIL ACTION AGAINST  
CHRISTOPHER L. MEINER TO COLLECT THE AMOUNT OF \$1,500.00 FOR THE LOSS  
OF ONE (1) MULE DEER FAWN; AND FURTHER MOVE THAT THE DIRECTOR, AS  
SECRETARY TO THE COMMISSION, BE DIRECTED TO SIGN AND ISSUE A FINDING  
OF FACT, CONCLUSIONS OF LAW AND AN ORDER IN THIS MATTER PURSUANT TO  
THIS MOTION.

**Vote:** Unanimous

\* \* \* \* \*

These hearings concluded at 4:04 p.m.

\* \* \* \* \*